



**Final Report and Recommendation
to the City of Kenora
Police Costing Review Committee**

January 10, 2008

Table of Contents:

<u>Subject</u>	<u>Page Number</u>
Executive Summary	3-8
The Review Process	8-10
Staffing Models	11-25
Direct Operating Expenses	25-27
Police Generated Revenues	27-28
OPP Generated Recoveries and Adjustments	28-29
Summary of Cost Statements and Direct Operating Expenses	29-30
One Time Start-Up Costs	31-33
Financial Summary of Proposals	33-35
Recommendation	35-38
<u>Tables:</u>	
Table 1: Comparative Police Resources Populations and Rates Per Capita	39-40
Table 2A: Kenora Police Service Salary and Benefits Sworn Members	41
Table 2B: Kenora Police-Salaries and Benefits Civilian Members	42
Table 3: Kenora Police Direct Operating Expenses	43
Table 4: Ontario Provincial Police Direct Operating Expenses OPP Costing Summary	44 45-46

Executive Summary:

The City of Kenora was created on January 1, 2000 through the amalgamation of the former Town of Kenora with the Townships of Keewatin and Jaffray-Melick. The new City of Kenora formed the second largest populated centre in North-Western Ontario with 15,838 residents and was surpassed in size only by the City of Thunder Bay's population of 109,016¹.

The City of Kenora is located on the Trans-Canada Highway #17 and lies 200 kilometers east of Winnipeg, Manitoba and 500 kilometers west of Thunder Bay, Ontario. The Canadian National Railway's main Trans-Canada rail route crosses through the centre of the City of Kenora's business district. The City lies on the shore of the Lake of the Woods and the community offers a four season superb recreational area for both local residents and seasonal cottage owners and visitors. Most of the transient and tourist population travels to the City of Kenora from the Winnipeg, Manitoba area and from Aboriginal communities in the surrounding District of Kenora.

Since the time of amalgamation the population of the City of Kenora has been in a state of decline. Between the 2001 census taking and the 2006 census the recorded population has declined by 661 residents representing a per cent decline in the population of 4.2%.² The most contributing factors to this declining population is the closure of forest based industries in the District of Kenora felt particularly hard by the City of Kenora when the Abitibi Consolidated Inc. mill closed production in 2006.

The full impact of the declining economy of Kenora is illustrated in reports produced by the City of Kenora for both the 2007 Ontario Municipal Association and for the Rural Ontario Municipal Association Conferences in Ontario. These reports were referenced in earlier reports in this study and they are available through the City of Kenora.

The City of Kenora is a community of 210 sq km and contains 6,251 full-time households.³ The City contains 323 km of municipally maintained roadways. The City of Kenora is currently policed by both the former Town of Kenora Police Service and the Ontario Provincial Police. The combined policing strength of the two police services is 46.12 uniformed positions. The OPP policing is provided under a Section 10 Police Services Act contract agreement providing 11.12 OPP officers under the direction of a Staff Sergeant-Detachment Commander and the Kenora

¹ Population statements from Statistics Canada Community Profiles of populations in 2001 census figures.

² Population statements from Statistics Canada profiles of populations in 2006 census figures.

³ Household and land size statements from Statistics Canada Community Profiles in 2006 census reports.

Police Service has a policing complement of 35 uniformed officers under the direction of a Chief and Deputy Chief of Police.

Based on the 2007 Statistics Canada report on Police Resources in Canada-2006 the City of Kenora Police Service costs on a per capita basis are the most expensive municipal policing operation in all of Ontario (excluding First Nations Policing Services).⁴ That report established the Kenora Police Services costs in 2006 at \$468 per capita. The report cited a population figure of 9,603 and a total policing cost figure of \$4,496,717.

The OPP policed portion of the City of Kenora per capita costs were stated in the same report to be \$160 per capita. The report cited a population of 7,139 in Keewatin and Jaffray-Melick and a total policing cost figure of \$1,144,728.

The combined population according to that report is 16,742 which is well above the known Statistics Canada census figure of 15,177. Continuing to use the reports population of 16,742 the net per capita policing costs for both the OPP and Kenora Police Service cited in that report would be \$336.96 per capita. If the census figure of 15,177 is used the per capita cost for policing in the City of Kenora in 2006 is \$371 per capita.

In the Police Resources in Canada 2007 report the average per capita cost for policing in Ontario in 2006 is \$268.

This same report determined the Kenora Police Service had the highest number of officers per population for all municipalities in Ontario with populations greater than 5,000 people. The Kenora officer per capita rate was 1:267. The next closest community was the Town of Gananoque (population 5428) with a per capita rate of 1:362. This is a significant difference and shows the disproportionate number of officers required to police the Kenora Police jurisdiction at present. The OPP patrolled portion of the City of Kenora has an officer to population ratio of 1:595.

On a comparison basis, the Ontario averaged officer to population rate for all municipalities with a population greater than 5000 people (excluding Aboriginal Policed communities) in the 2007 Police Resources in Canada report showed a rate of 1 police officer for every 772 people.

In that report, using only municipal policed jurisdictions, the averaged police to population rate was 1 police officer to every 617 people.⁵

In conducting the appraisal of the two proposals a comparative of other similar sized Ontario and Manitoba Police Services was completed and that comparative is attached as Table 1.

⁴ Police Resources in Canada 2007-Canadian Centre for Justice Report- Catalogue no. 85-225-XIE, Page 49.

⁵ Police Resources in Canada 2007-Canadian Centre for Justice Report-Catalogue no. 85-225-XIE, Pages 32-34.

This Table provides a fairly representative profile of the policing costs and staff levels of the Ontario Provincial Police, RCMP and Municipal Police Services. These figures are based on year-end 2006 costs with the staffing profiles developed as of May 15, 2006.⁶

At the December 18, 2007 presentations the Kenora Police Service Chief Dan Jorgensen stated that increased reporting requirements for criminal investigations were impacting heavily on the police costs. Specific reference was made to the detailed Crown Brief submissions for crimes like Break and Enter, Impaired Driving and a significant increase in police time spent reporting on Domestic Violence investigations. Other comments were made of the impact of regulatory police training, the meeting and complying with police Adequacy Standards, the providing of court security and the time spent by police officers in populating multiple incident data basis as significant consumers of police patrol time. All of these requirements are equally imposing on other Ontario police agencies including the Ontario Provincial Police.

The Kenora Police Service slide presentation demonstrated the exaggerated crime rates, per capita officer rates, and per capita police cost rates that are occurring in the Kenora Police jurisdiction. A genuine effort is now being made by Chief Jorgensen to change the operating mode of the Kenora Police Service from a reactive to a proactive service and their response to the Request For Proposal, Annual Business Plan 2005 and 2006, and their 2008 to 2010 Business Plan filed during the review in October and November 2007 is indicative of that desire

Chief Jorgensen is aware that unless a significant shift to a preventative policing approach is made the crime rate in the Kenora Police Service area will continue to be at a rate that exceeds all other municipal and OPP policed communities in Ontario.⁷ The reactive response model will always require more and more investment in policing positions to address the escalations in police workloads but a shift to a proactive model also requires a significant resource investment to bring about change. In the case of the Kenora Police proposal, an investment of at least five additional officers.

In the OPP policed portion of the City of Kenora the crime rate in the Statistics Canada 2007 report is expressed as 2,970 crimes per 100,000 population. The Kenora Police Service rate was recorded at 20,431 crimes per 100,000 population. In 2005 that crime rate was reported to be 18,966⁸.

It is important for the study to consider which policing model, the OPP or the Kenora Police Services, will have the greatest success in reducing the high City crime rate and which police

⁶ Police Resources in Canada 2007-Canadian Centre for Justice Report-Catalogue no. 85-225-XIE, pages 32-36 and pages 48-52.

⁷ Police Resources in Canada-2007 report on 2006 criminal incident rates per population, page 49 Catalogue Number 85-225.

⁸ City of Kenora, 2007 Presentation to the Association of Municipality-Ontario, page 6.

service has the strongest framework to provide the broad based proactive and enforcement programs the City of Kenora will need to ensure a safe community. These service considerations are as important as the cost of the police service.

In conducting community interviews the respondents in the former Town of Kenora wanted to keep their local police service and the respondents in the former Townships of Jaffray-Melick and Keewatin wanted to keep their Ontario Provincial Police Service. Respondents did view the Kenora Police Service as being a more flexible police service and in some cases more creative in their response to community needs. The OPP were seen as more policy and procedure driven.

The same respondents saw the Ontario Provincial Police as a better equipped and better trained police service. There was only one community respondent who suggested that if a serious crime was to occur at his business premise or home and he had a choice between which service would respond that the Kenora Police Service would be chosen. All other respondents, without hesitation, opted for an OPP response to serious crimes in their home and community.

The Senior Crown Attorney and the Head of the Department of Pathology at the Lake of the Woods District Hospital held very strong opinions on the superior investigative qualities of the Ontario Provincial Police Force.

Other key stakeholders, particularly those in the business community and seniors, wanted to see higher police service levels and were for the most part impartial to which service was to be the police service provided that better and more visible police presence was delivered in the core business district.

Interviews of the homeless and persons living in the street expressed strong views about their treatment by the police and they were of the opinion that their crimes and their victimization were under serviced by the Kenora Police Service.

The Treaty Three Police Service is well regarded by the Ontario Provincial Police and the two forces enjoy a strong, mutually beneficial relationship.

Protocols exist between the OPP and Treaty Three Police Service for shared support services and those protocols include the expectation that members of either service will take enforcement action in each others patrol areas when required.

The Kenora Police Service filed a similar proposal that they would hope to enter into in the future with both the Treaty Three Police Service and with the OPP Kenora Detachment but these proposals are not in place and have not yet been negotiated.⁹

⁹ See Tab 10 of the Supplementary Information-Kenora Police Service Response to the Request for Proposal.

Many of these policing observations were not unexpected in a policing study since change is seldom universally embraced by the public. As well, the ultimate decision involves choosing one service over the other and that decision will always draw criticisms of bias, lack of information, and of the decision being careless. A suggestion was recently made that the Council should give the job of policing of the City of Kenora to the Kenora Police Service and if it does not work out, they could make a change to the OPP. That suggestion just does not make sense but what does make sense is to make a decision based on fact and service capability rather than on emotion and personal desires.

The City of Kenora Council is fortunate in that they have had both police services policing in the City of Kenora for the past eight years and the Council and staff now have the advantage of the direct knowledge and experience of working with both police services.

Overall, the study has found that in terms of meeting community expectations that both police services had areas where they could improve, areas where they both excelled, and other areas that found one service was clearly superior to the other.

The study was also concerned with some areas of non-compliance to Adequacy Standards and to Ministry Policing Standards by the Kenora Police Service and the Kenora Police Services Board most of which are remedied or being remedied. However some others, including recommendations made in the Ministry audit, have not yet been fully addressed.

Audits of both police services were carefully reviewed. There were no areas of non-compliance with Regulations or Ministry Standards found at the Ontario Provincial Police operations in Kenora.

Two other reports were developed during the study. The first report identified concerns for the existing Hybrid policing model in Kenora particularly as it relates to duplications of police positions and services and for the high cost of operating the hybrid model.¹⁰ The second report was a background document providing information and areas that would be considered during the review of the final Request for Proposal submissions.¹¹ These two reports, while not binding on the Council Police Costing Review Committee or the responding police services, are important documents for consideration in this final report.

Ultimately, this policing study will determine which police service demonstrates the greatest degree of readiness to police the total city area, the extent of the additional supports that the

¹⁰ Report on Hybrid Policing in Kenora, July 2007 by John Watkins-City of Kenora Police Costing Review Committee Report

¹¹ Supplementary Information to the Request for Proposal for the Providing of City-wide Policing Services to the City of Kenora, October 4,2007 by John Watkins-City of Kenora Police Costing Review Committee Report.

expanded policing operation would require, and which service has demonstrated the highest degree of public and municipal accountability. Finally, the study is mandated to make a determination as to which police service is most capable of providing effective and adequate police services to the city-wide community and at the best cost.

The Council Police Costing Review Committee issued a detailed Request for Proposal containing twenty-eight areas that both police services have now addressed and forwarded to the Committee as their model of city-wide policing. That Request for Proposal identified legislative/regulatory requirements and outlined the community expressed needs and expectations for a city-wide policing service in the future.

1. The Review Process:

In 1999 the City of Kenora amalgamation Steering Committee undertook an initial study of policing services as part of the transitioning of services for the new municipality of the City of Kenora. That Committee, faced with several other amalgamation issues, never completed the policing services study and agreed that *in the interim* the two police services would police their respective jurisdictions and a future municipal council of the City of Kenora should make the important policing decision.

Policing is the only municipal service that has not been fully amalgamated as a single service in the City of Kenora.

Policing costs in the City of Kenora in 2007 are expected to reach more than \$6-million in 2007. This equates to a cost representing 25% of all annual tax revenues collected in the City of Kenora.

Faced with a commitment to meet citizen expectations for cost containment, the City of Kenora Municipal Council passed a resolution in June 2007 that requested the Ontario Provincial Police and the City of Kenora Police Service to submit proposals for policing the whole of the City of Kenora as a single service provider.

The Council in June 2007 defined the criteria for the policing study as:

“The City of Kenora proposes to engage the services of a consultant to develop a municipal police services costing model. The model will be based on a consultative approach intended to provide adequate and effective policing service consistent with the core functions and adequacy standards as set out in the Police Services Act. The consultant will be requested to take the process from the initial development of a Policing Model through stakeholder consultation, to development of a RFP for police costing, evaluation of proposals and final report and recommendation to Council.”

The City of Kenora approved the formation of the Council Police Costing Review Committee (CPCRC) and appointed Councilor Dave McCann as Chairperson and Councilors Wendy Cuthbert and Charito Drinkwalter as committee members. Councilor Chris Van Wallegghem was appointed as an alternate committee member if any other member could not attend. Mr. Van Wallegghem was at each committee meeting and to his credit he took an active role in all meetings. As well, other members of Council and Mayor Compton were in attendance at many committee meetings where they held ex-officio status.

The Committee established a timeline of completion of the research for the project of September 30, 2007 and the Committee expected Council approval of the Request for Proposal in early October 2007 and the return of the police service responses by November 30, 2007. Despite the intensity of the timelines the project has proceeded on schedule including the six week period allotted to the two police services for their responses.

On July 15, 2007 the CPCRC Committee posted a direct link on the City of Kenora Information Portal that allowed any member of the public direct access to the Consultant and the Committee. As well, all committee meetings followed the City of Kenora procedural by-laws and each meeting was advertised to allow public presentations to the Committee.

In addition to this level of access into the project the Committee held three public meetings. The first meeting on August 29, 2007 outlined the study process and allowed the public opportunity to present their input to the study and express any additional criteria for consideration. A second public meeting was held on October 4, 2007 where the proposed Request for Proposal criteria was explained to the public and the public had direct opportunity to identify any further areas that the RFP should address. The final RFP contained this public input prior to the release of the document. The final public meeting was held on December 18, 2007 where the two police services presented their proposed policing models to the full Municipal Council of the City of Kenora. All three community meetings were attended by approximately 85 to 110 citizens, police officers, and their supporters. This turnout (110) is less than 1% of the total community population.

As required in the policing study process a broad based community consultation was conducted involving more than 120 interviews of organizations, community groups and individuals in the City of Kenora. These interviews included the New Horizons seniors organization, the Kenora Senior's Advocacy organization, members of the Municipal Council, members of the Kenora Police Services Board, Economic Development managers, the Chief of the Treaty Three Police Service, the Grand Chief of the Treaty Three Nation, District of Kenora-Justice Fraser, the District of Kenora Senior Crown Attorney and Kenora Bar Association President, Department Heads and CAO of the Lake of the Woods District Hospital, The Executive Director of the Morningstar Treatment Facility, the Executive Director of the Sakaate House Women's Shelter, the Chamber of Commerce President, the Kenora.biz President, business owners in all three communities, the Make Kenora Home Chairpersons, Lake Association Executives, Native Street Patrol Manager and NeeChee Centre Executive Officer, City of Kenora Fire Chief, the Manager of

the Winkler Pavilion, the Kenora Prays Ministerial group, the Legal Aid Executive Director, the Ontario Works Executive Director, the Catholic School Board Executive Director, School Board Superintendents, former Police Chiefs, former OPP District Commanders, both OPP and Kenora Police senior managers, members of the Kenora Police Association, and citizens who have accepted responsibility for the care and feeding of the homeless and street persons.

It is my opinion that the City of Kenora has completed a more than sufficient, if not the largest consultation process, in Ontario for determining a police service provider.

The process was mired by two factors. Chief of Dan Jorgensen advised the Consultant in August 2007 that all correspondence with the Kenora Police Service had to be in writing which restricted the Consultant from having direct open discussion with any member of the Kenora Police Service as well as the senior management of the Service. This restriction hindered the position of the Kenora Police Service by not allowing their full input or assisting them in designing their final proposal. This requirement was never withdrawn during the process.

The second factor was the failure of the Kenora Police Services Board to provide the Ontario Provincial Police with the information that the OPP routinely seeks from municipal police services in developing a police costing. The requests relate to a variety of statistical and other information that is necessary to accurately determine the policing requirements of the community. The failure to provide this documentation created a situation where the OPP was deemed to not have had all of the information required to properly assess the policing requirements of the City. The Committee and Municipal Council have since required the production of these reports from the Kenora Police Services Board.

On December 18, 2007 the Council Police Costing Committee Chair announced that an enhanced system of Civilian Data Entry had been approved by the Committee. Civilian Data Entry has proven to increase the availability of police officers in other Ontario jurisdictions by as much as 20%. Civilian Data Entry also provides a more efficient incident recording capability, standardizing of report structures and uniformity in the police reporting processes. It does not relieve police officers of all reporting requirements but it certainly addresses the majority of the reports, particularly those not involving court processes.

The Kenora Police Service included costs of the initial data recording equipment at \$70,579.56 for a commercial grade system and these costs are within the experienced costs of other police services. The study accepts this cost and this cost is removed from the submissions since it will be applicable to either services operations and represents a cost that will be the responsibility of the City of Kenora regardless of which police service proposal is accepted.

Both police services indicated two civilian staffing positions or full-time equivalents (FTE's) will be required for this function. These salary and benefit costs are included in both of the police service's staffing costs.

2. Staffing Models:

The Ontario Provincial Police Force has submitted a staffing model that is based *on an integrated detachment* of 82 Ontario Provincial Police officers. The OPP have designated 42.56 positions as municipally funded positions in their integrated model and the proposed contract for the City of Kenora is based on the OPP delivering an annual minimum of 60,000 hours of police service. All OPP contracts in Ontario are defined by the number of hours of policing service to be provided and from that statement the OPP determine the number of OPP officers required to deliver this level of service.

The OPP define the integrated detachment approach as:

“When a municipality chooses to receive police services from the OPP under contract, the OPP will ensure that the required resource levels are met. The shared infrastructure of the OPP broadens local access to resources, expertise, solutions, training and management without duplicating services. In this case, the City of Kenora will continue to benefit as additional staff are available from within the Kenora OPP Detachment as well as neighbouring detachments and regions, should the need arise.¹²”

The Ontario Provincial Police proposal at 42.5 OPP positions most closely matches *the front line service levels* of the existing policing model. The OPP model contains 1.06 management positions divided between an Inspector-Detachment Commander and a Staff-Sergeant support position.

The OPP model, including Civilian Data Entry positions, contains 7 civilian Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) support positions. OPP Communications and Guard positions are defined as a set cost rather than as a set number of positions.

The Kenora Police Service has submitted a proposal based on a mainly *stand alone municipal police operation*. This is an enhanced police staffing model now containing 51 members (49 front-line/support positions) moving their staffing upward by 5 uniformed constable members from the existing 46 uniformed positions now serving the City. The OPP proposal was submitted in 2008 salary and benefit levels and the Kenora Police Service model was submitted in 2007 estimated salary and benefits.

The Kenora Police Service have been operating under a policing Collective Agreement that expired in 2005. Chief Dan Jorgensen advised that in making the cost submissions that he applied a factor of 3% to the actual 2006 salary and benefit costs to reach his 2007 cost

¹² OPP Policing Proposal for the City of Kenora, page 4 at Tab 3 of the Supplementary Information submitted on November 30, 2007

statement. To bring the Kenora Police proposal even with the OPP and to reflect more closely the expected 2008 salary figures a further 3% factor was applied to the Kenora Police Services salary and benefit cost projections. Police costs in Ontario have annually advanced at a rate of 3 to 4% per year. Choosing 3% as the adjusted value is reasonable.

The recalculation of the Kenora Police salary and benefit schedules is attached to this report as Table #2-A and Table 2-B. A summation error of \$96,433 occurred in the Kenora Police Uniformed 2007 Salary and Benefit chart that is corrected in Table 2A. The new calculation shows 2007 salary and benefits at \$5,217,395 and the 2008 costs recalculated to \$5,373,916 representing a difference of \$156,522.

The Kenora Police Model provides newly created policing positions and advances some existing support positions from part-time to full-time. These positions are to staff the following police functions:

- Constable-Training Officer
- Constable-Community Services Officer
- Constable-Crime Analyst/Policy Review
- Constable-Guns and Gangs Enforcement
- Constable-Youth Bureau

The Kenora Police proposal provides a criminal investigative strength of six constables and one Detective Sergeant including the Forensic Officer position which is now moved to a full-time position.

The Kenora Police Service will be supported by a civilian support staff of 15 full-time and 12 part-time civilian employees assigned to various functions including Communications/CPIC and the new Civilian Data Entry functions.

The Kenora Police model provides four platoons consisting of a Uniformed Sergeant supervisor and six Constables. The deployment of the shifts will be two constables in the Town of Kenora, two constables in each of the Townships of Jaffray-Melick and Keewatin.

Other listed support functions include two members on traffic patrol, two members on foot and bicycle patrol, and two officers for marine, snow and ATV patrol as seasonally required.¹³

The Kenora Police Service response indicates the service will have a designated Criminal Intelligence Service Officer (CISO), one officer to drug enforcement assigned to the Joint Forces

¹³ Section 2 b) and c) of the Request For Proposal-Kenora Police Service

Drug Operation in the Kenora region, and one officer assigned to the function of Guns and Gangs and Organized Crime enforcement.¹⁴

In total the Kenora Police proposal consists of:

- 1- Chief of Police
- 1- Deputy Police Chief
- 5- Sergeants
- 44- Constables
- 1- Chief's Secretary
- 1- Clerk/Receptionist
- 1- Caretaker
- 1-Communications Supervisor
- 4- Full-time Police Communications Operators
- 2- Part-time Police Communications Operators
- 2- Civilian Data Entry (new)
- 2- Court Security-Special Constables
- 9- Prisoner Guards

The adjusted 2008 Salary and Benefit costs for this model is **\$ 6,409,929.**¹⁵

¹⁴ See Section 2 (c) of the Response to Proposal-Kenora Police Service.

¹⁵ Sum of Tables 2A and 2B.

The Ontario Provincial Police model consists of:

.53 Inspector-Detachment Commander

.53 Staff Sergeant-Operations Support

5- Sergeants

36.50 Constables

2- OAG 10 Civilian (Court Special Constables)

2.5 OAG 8 Civilian Administrators

2 OAG 6 Civilian Data Entry Operators (new)

.5 Caretaker

Communication Operators: \$69,713

Prisoner Guard: \$29,792

OSS Pay and Benefit Charge: \$14,184

The 2008 Salary and Benefit costs for this staffing model is: **\$5,213,672**¹⁶

The integrated aspect of the Ontario Provincial Police model blends the City of Kenora OPP complement with other detachment and regional OPP positions. The Kenora Detachment will consist of three staffing elements. The City of Kenora contract would involve 42.5 officers, the Province pays for 23 OPP officers through provincial funding, and 16.5 OPP officers for patrol of the unorganized territories of the detachment jurisdiction and for servicing of one other OPP contract. The OPP integrated model is also supported by Kenora based OPP Regional specialists.

The OPP platoon staffing model with seven constables and a Sergeant, is stronger than the Kenora Police Service model in that it provides one additional constable patrol officer per shift and the OPP Sergeant Supervisor is a patrol position.

Kenora Police Sergeants are detailed to the Kenora Police Headquarters to supervise communications operations and perform station duties. The Sergeants in the Kenora Police Service model are not patrolling positions.¹⁷

¹⁶ See Page 44-OPP Costing Summary-Total Salary and Benefits.

This difference creates two additional OPP officers for front-line patrol duties. The difference becomes greater during the evening hours when the Kenora Police Association Collective Agreement expects the Kenora Police vehicles to have a two member complement between the hours of 4:00 p.m. and 8:00 a.m.¹⁸ This requirement will reduce the number of patrolling Kenora Police vehicles in the community to a maximum of three patrol vehicles.

The OPP patrol car complement policies do not require two member patrols for policing in built up and urban areas where back-up units are readily available and in close proximity.¹⁹ The OPP model provides for as many as eight patrol vehicles in the City of Kenora.

The OPP staffing strategy will provide 5 officers patrolling in the Town of Kenora (with one officer designated to traffic patrol duties throughout the City) and one officer allocated to Jaffray-Melick and one officer to the Keewatin zones.²⁰

In addition, the OPP indicate their traffic enforcement programs will be augmented by a Sergeant and a five constable member Traffic Unit at Kenora Detachment. These officers can be detailed to address specific traffic issues in the City of Kenora as required. The OPP Kenora Detachment lists two members trained as Technical Collision Investigation and Re-constructionist for the higher technical investigation of serious injury and fatal collisions.

The OPP utilize their platoon officers for foot and bicycle patrol. The snow vehicle and ATV patrol functions will be accomplished by the Kenora Detachment utilizing contract and non-contract members of the Kenora OPP and also by utilizing the Regionalized OPP Snow Vehicle/ATV/Vessel Enforcement Team (SAVE TEAM).

Marine patrols in the City of Kenora will be conducted by the provincial funded positions at Kenora Detachment. The detachment has a five vessels complement with two of these vessels docked in the boathouse at the Water Street OPP site. Patrols of Provincial Waterways in Ontario by the OPP are a responsibility that is 100% provincially funded.

The OPP proposal contains two Court Officers with one of the two court constable positions being funded within the City of Kenora contract.

The OPP model, like the Kenora Police Model, provides for a youth officer.

The OPP will provide a street level crime and drug enforcement capability utilizing one or both of the constable positions built into the OPP model.

¹⁷ See Page 21 response in Section 8.

¹⁸ See Tab 7 at Page 53 for the Letter of Intent section A) Two Officers Per Car between the Kenora Police Services Board and the Kenora Police Association, dated April 3, 2006.

¹⁹ See OPP response to the Request for Proposal under Section 3 (h).

²⁰ See OPP response to the Request for Proposal under Section 2 (b)

The Kenora Detachment integrated complement includes a constable assigned full-time to the Guns and Gangs investigation function. Funding for the position is partially covered through a Ministry grant program. The Kenora Police Services Guns and Gangs position funding will not be eliminated in the amalgamated OPP service and funding of at least two constable positions will continue under this grant funding.

The Community Services/Media position is shared between the Kenora Detachment and the City of Kenora contract with the City of Kenora funding .5 of this position.

Collectively, the Criminal Investigative Unit in the OPP contract model will consist of five Detective Constables, at least one Detective Constable designated for street level crime investigation, and supervised by a dedicated Detective Sergeant.

This City of Kenora OPP criminal investigation unit is augmented by a Detective Sergeant and four additional Detective Constables at Kenora Detachment. This will provide the City of Kenora with an available crime unit of two Detective Sergeants and nine Detective Constables.

The OPP Communications Centres at Thunder Bay and Kenora include on-duty uniformed supervisors. The Thunder Bay Communications Centre staffing model calls for a Sergeant and 11 civilian radio personnel on each shift to handle call-taking and dispatch functions. The City of Kenora is serviced by three OPP towers any one of which can provide full communications coverage to the City of Kenora.²¹

Full-time OPP employed civilian Communications Technicians are stationed at each OPP Communications Centre (Kenora and Thunder Bay) in the event of the failure of any of the OPP provided communications equipment. Bell Canada provides the maintenance and repair of the FleetNet towers and for all future upgrades of the communications systems.²²

Forensic investigation services will be performed by a Forensic Sergeant-Unit Commander and four Forensic Constables stationed at the OPP Forensic Unit on Water Street. In addition, this Forensic Unit has a full-time Scenes of Crimes coordinator who is a blood stain pattern analyst and qualified to give expert evidence on blood pattern evidence in all levels of courts.

The OPP report that they will be building and staffing a new 11,000 square foot Level-3 Forensic Laboratory in the City of Kenora with construction expected to commence in 2010. The actual staff requirements for this facility have not yet been determined but these staff positions will be funded provincially and will not result in additional cost downloads to the OPP contract in Kenora.

The OPP integrated policing model does not require the staffing of a training officer position. The OPP maintains a Regionally deployed training unit of a Sergeant and three Constables in

²¹ See OPP response to the Request for Proposal, Section 5.10 (f).

²² See OPP response to the Request for Proposal, Section 5 (6).

the City of Kenora to conduct mandatory and OPP specified training to the OPP members and Treaty Three and Treaty Nine Police Officers in the North-West Region. The OPP and the Kenora Police Service have partnered for mandatory annual training using the OPP deployed training unit which is a cost effective method of meeting on-going training standards. However, the Kenora Police response indicates that the Kenora Police Service will discontinue this training partnership and have costed a full time training officer into their proposal.²³

The OPP operates on an automated Intelligence Cube Analysis System that analyzes and generates detailed reports on crime and traffic trends to provide timely profiles of the OPP calls for service. In addition, the Results Driven Policing Analysis Systems and reporting mechanisms produce a high level of accountability between the detachment operations, Regional Headquarters and the Provincial Commanders and Commissioner.²⁴

These automated systems do not require a police officer to perform call, traffic and work load analysis functions.

The Kenora Police Model indicates two officers will be trained in Crime Analysis and their model creates a full-time Constable-Policy Development/Crime Analyst position.

The Intelligence Officer position in the Kenora OPP proposal is completed by the OPP Regional Intelligence Officer at the Thunder Bay Regional Crime Unit. The Kenora Police proposal maintains the position of an Intelligence Officer funded by the Criminal Investigations Service of Ontario (CISO).

The two policing proposals operate on two different models. The OPP have a clear cost advantage in being able to share many of their services between provincially funded and municipally funded operations. The OPP also spread their support and non-front line services costs across several communities and from detachment to detachment. In the City of Kenora the Ontario Provincial Police have placed a large number of specialist criminal investigation position to the OPP Kenora facility on Water Street. Collectively, this makes their policing capability very strong.

The Kenora Police Service, without this integration capability, must staff their support and investigative positions internally. This creates higher costs and requires a larger number of police positions to service their operations. The contractual requirement for two member patrol cars and the decision to use the on-duty Sergeants to supervise the Communications area are also service impairments in the Kenora Police Service model that are not faced in the OPP policing proposal.

²³ See the Kenora Police Service response to the Request for Proposal, Section 11 (2).

²⁴ Results Driven Policing: North-West Region Breakdown By Detachment published by Operational Policy & Strategic Planning Bureau, Report 07-09

Given the available OPP Regionalized and Provincial supports units shared through the OPP integrated detachment and the efficiencies of a Civilian Data Entry system I am satisfied the OPP can provide a policing service with 42.5 OPP positions that is at least equal to the current front-line service levels being provided to the City of Kenora.

My earlier report entitled *Supplementary Information to the Request for Proposal* **suggested** that the police responses should contain, as a minimum, the same 46 positions as are currently policing the City of Kenora. That comment was based on the expectation that at least one of the police services or both might proceed with the development of a fully stand alone policing model utilizing less patrol officers. A stand alone police model can not be supported with less than the 46 uniformed positions suggested in that report.

The OPP model integrates 82 OPP members under a single detachment command structure.

For this OPP or the Kenora Police proposal to be successful they must meet two fundamental tests. The first test is a determination of whether the new policing scheme will meet the requirement of Adequacy and Effectiveness as defined by the Regulations and in a more general way by the Police Services Act.

The second test, deals with the issue of whether the abolished police service members are being dealt with fairly during the change to a new police service. That fairness test can be met either through the continued employment of the police service members or if their continued employment is not possible, by fairly providing for these employees through severance or other negotiated settlements. It is generally expected that severance liability will be limited to full-time police service employees. These severance entitlements will be a responsibility of the City of Kenora to address. The issue of severance entitlement does not need to be finalized before a policing change can occur but these matters either need to be settled or the issue of severance entitlement needs to be in the process of mediation/arbitration.

If the OPP proposal is accepted all uniformed members of the Kenora Police Service will be offered employment. The two civilian administrative positions will be retained as will the Court Security employees. The Janitor position, if retained by the City, will be for the maintenance of any City owned buildings used by the OPP. The five full-time civilian dispatcher positions will likely reduce to part-time employment for four of the employees or full-time employment for two employees for assignment to the Civilian Data Entry area. Guards and Matrons of the Kenora Police Service are expected to retain their part-time employment (as needed basis) with the OPP. In a worst case scenario projection, three full-time civilian employees and four part-time dispatch positions will not retain positions with the OPP.

In dealing with the primary question of adequacy and equivalency, it would be difficult to argue that the Ontario Provincial Police could ever be found to be less than an adequate police service. The primary issue to be determined is whether the proposed OPP integrated model will provide an equivalent level of service to the City of Kenora.

Generally, if the number of front-line patrol police officers is equal or better than the level provided in the existing policing arrangement then an argument that the model is less than adequate becomes hard to sustain. In examining the OPP integrated model for the City of Kenora the equivalency threshold, in my opinion, has been met by the Ontario Provincial Police. That conclusion is best illustrated by a comparison of the OPP model to the existing policing model.

Equivalency of the OPP Model to the Existing Police Strength- City of Kenora

	<u>City of Kenora</u> <u>PS</u>	<u>Contract</u> <u>OPP</u> <u>Kenora</u>	<u>Status</u> <u>Quo</u> <u>Policing</u>	<u>OPP Proposed</u> <u>Integrated</u> <u>Model</u>
Chief	1		1	0
Deputy Chief	1		1	0
Inspector			0	0.53
Staff Sergeant		0.14	0.14	0.53
Sergeants	5	0.84	5.84	5
Constables	28	10.14	38.14	36.5
Special Constables- Court	2		2	2
Dispatch- Full Time Positions	5		5	\$69,713*
Dispatch- Part Time Position	4		4	0
Clerical-Administrative	2	0.42	2.42	2.5
Caretaker	0	0.28	0.28	0.5
Permanent Part Time Guard	8		8	\$29,792
Occasional Part Time	1		1	0
Civilian Data Entry	0	0	0	2

Both police service proposals will provide an adequate police service to the City of Kenora.

Chief of Police Dan Jorgensen at the December 18, 2007 Public Meeting made the statement that "the Kenora Police can get all the OPP services as easily and quickly as the OPP can." While

his statement is true to a degree in that some OPP support services are provided without charge to municipal services through shared services agreements, there is no obligation for the OPP to provide snow vehicle patrol, special traffic patrols, police communications, training officers, detachment based crime investigators, forensic officers or communications supervisors to the Kenora Police Service operations. If directed by the Crown Attorney, or in a general state of emergency, the OPP will respond with resources. But it is not as automatic as Chief Jorgensen stated.

The OPP crime analysis systems are sophisticated systems that the OPP have developed for their own purposes. These systems provide a significant advantage in crime prevention, traffic collision and crime incident analysis and analysis of calls for service that is simply not present in or available to the Kenora Police Service operations. The OPP Results Driven Policing philosophy is strongly supported by this analysis capability.

The OPP in responding to a request for OPP support services or to share their resources (such as joint training) with a municipal police service must evaluate each request on a case by case basis and determines the extent of that OPP response.

While the threshold of an equivalent service has been met in relation to *the existing police service levels* it is of value to evaluate the enhanced staffing model proposed by the Kenora Police Service to the proposed integrated staffing model of the Ontario Provincial Police.

Equivalency of the OPP Model to the Proposed Kenora Police Model

	<u>Proposed City of Kenora PS</u>	<u>OPP Proposed Integrated Model</u>	<u>OPP Integrated Delivery Method</u>
Chief	1	0	
Deputy Chief	1	0	
Inspector	0	0.53	Alternate to the Chief Position
Staff Sergeant	0	0.53	Alternate to the Deputy Chief Position.
Sergeant-Criminal Investigation	1	1	Plus an additional D/Sgt. at Detachment

	<u>Proposed City of Kenora PS</u>	<u>OPP Proposed Integrated Model</u>	<u>OPP Integrated Delivery Method</u>
Sergeant-Communications	0	4	Kenora/Thunder Bay Communications.
Sergeant-Aboriginal Liaison	0	1	Full-time position assigned to the Treaty Three Police Office.
Sergeant Patrol Officer	4	4	OPP Sergeants on Patrol Four other Sergeants on patrol at Kenora Detachment
<u>Constable Availability:</u>			
Uniformed Patrol officers	24	28	OPP- Four for traffic patrol (on shift)
Detective Constables	5	5	Four additional Detective Constables at Kenora Detachment
Street level Crime Officer	0	1	
Policy Development/Analyst	1	0	OPP Automated Analysis Systems
Community Services/Media	1	1	.5 of this position at Detachment
Youth Officer	1	1	Same
Training Officer	1	4	Sergeant and 3 Csts. – Water Street
Forensic Officer	1	5	Sergeant and 4 Csts. - Water Street

	<u>Proposed City of Kenora PS</u>	<u>OPP Proposed Integrated Model</u>	<u>OPP Integrated Delivery Method</u>
Guns and Gangs/Organized Crime	1	1	Full-time Detachment provided
Drug Officer	1	4	Sergeant and 3 Csts. - Water Street
Court Case Manager-Constable	1	2	One paid by City contract
Intelligence Officer	1	1	OPP Officer in Thunder Bay
Traffic Management	2	6	OPP Traffic Sgt. and 5 Constables- OPP Highway Safety Division-Kenora
Foot, Bicycle, Marine and Snow Patrol	4	0	Provided by regular patrols, Regional SAVE Unit, and Detachment Marine Unit
<u>Civilian Support Positions:</u>			
Special Constables-Court	2	2	Same
Civilian Dispatcher Supervisor	1	4	CO- 3 positions in Thunder Bay
Communications Technicians	0	1	Communications Unit- Thunder Bay
Dispatch-FT	4 (1 per shift)	\$69,713	(11 OPP Dispatchers/Call takers per shift in Thunder Bay).
Dispatch-PT	2 (as required)	0	
Civilian Administrative - Clerical	2	2.5	Enhanced in OPP Model
Building Caretaker	1	0.5	City to provide for Municipal Buildings
Civilian Data Entry	2	2	Same
Permanent and Part Time Guard/Matrons	9	\$29,792	Set fee based on Provincial averaging

This Chart clearly demonstrated the OPP proposal, with other Regional and Detachment supports, is equivalent to the proposed Kenora Police model. Regionally supplied supports to the Kenora Detachment are charged back to the City of Kenora inside the OPP costing proposal. In the City of Kenora proposal an assessment of \$59,286 for Regional Headquarters Municipal Support and \$27,621 for Operational Supports are assessed for the use of Regional and Provincial deployed OPP resources to the City of Kenora.²⁵

The above comparisons do not include other OPP support positions assigned to the OPP Water Street facility. These positions include two Detective Inspectors-Major Case Managers, two Detective Constables to the Rural and Agricultural Crime Unit (Property Crimes), and a Constable and Civilian position for the Crime Stoppers program in Kenora. These OPP specialists are available to the City of Kenora and their services are contemplated within the "RHQ Municipal Supports" costs of the contract.

The primary advantage and disadvantage between the two policing models appears to be a desire for a localized police communications service, local officer familiarity with the community, and increased hours of operation at the Kenora Police Service office.

The OPP Communications will be utilizing the enhanced 911 call locator digitalized mapping system that maps the exact location of a caller's location on the dispatch terminal. The location of that call is frozen on the dispatch screen and even if the caller hangs-up or their call is interrupted the call location remains until the OPP call-taker release the call.

Cell phone callers will be the exception and the OPP mapping system will show the cell-tower the call is being processed through. Knowing the cell phone number will maintain on-going call back capabilities. This handling of cell phone calls will be the same for either police service.

There was comment at the three Open House presentations concerning the job losses to the Kenora community when the OPP Communications Centre relocates to Thunder Bay. The OPP Communications Supervisor in Kenora advised in October 2007 that only nine positions are being transferred. The remaining staff are either retiring to the City of Kenora or the classified employees have chosen not to take the offered positions in Thunder Bay and they will discontinue their employment. This is not a lay-off situation and these employees will be terminating their employ with the OPP.

²⁵ See OPP Tab 3-OPP Costing Summary for the City of Kenora.

*All new civilian positions required in the OPP City of Kenora policing model will be first offered to displaced Kenora Police Service full-time civilian members in accordance with Section 25 of the Request for Proposal.*²⁶

Without question, the OPP communications system is superior technologically to the Kenora Police Service equipment but the OPP proposal does not provide staffing of the police buildings 24 hours per day. The Civilian Data Entry employees may allow OPP service offices to be open for extended hours but the general after hours contact for the OPP in Kenora will be through the direct link external telephone at the front of each OPP building.

The Committee will have to assess the importance of having police buildings open versus using the outside direct phone link to the OPP Communications Centre in Thunder Bay. In the OPP staffing model, with as many as eight patrol vehicles in the City, the OPP expect that a patrol officer can be at any one of their police service centres in three to five minutes. The OPP Communications Centre also has a uniformed Sergeant to assist with any public enquiries that can be handled by phone contact.

Ministry Policing Standards anticipate the external phone connect to a police communications centre as being an acceptable level of public access to the police service. In Section 5 of the Policing Standards Manual: Framework for Business Planning, the Ministry statement is made that:

“(The Board), in partnership with the Chief of Police, will include in the business plan a police facilities plan that, at minimum, ensures that the police service maintains one or more police facilities that are accessible to the public during normal working hours, and that during all other hours public telecommunications access to a communications centre.”

Maintaining 24 hour seven day per week access to the police service buildings by the public is not a policing service requirement.

The remaining concern is that the Kenora Police Service members know the community better than the OPP officers. The Kenora Police response to the Request for Proposal indicate that their police service have 13 members who have been with the police service in Kenora more than ten years. The OPP response indicated that 21 member of their police service have resided in the City of Kenora for more than 10 years.²⁷

²⁶ This position on employment opportunity for the Kenora Police Service civilian members has been confirmed by the OPP Municipal Policing Branch in the RFP and by Chief Superintendent Michael Armstrong-OPP North-west Regional Commander on December 19, 2007.

²⁷ See Responses to the Request for Proposal-Section 2.

If the OPP proposal is chosen, offers of employment to all of the uniformed Kenora Police Service members will be made. It is reasonable to expect that most of the Kenora Police Service members will choose to join the Ontario Provincial Police and remain in the community. The OPP salary and benefit package is more lucrative for the members and they are accepted with full recognition for service time, promotion entitlements, and other superior contractual benefits. This transferability between the two police service members would retain the local knowledge base that is important to the public.

If the Kenora Police Service model is chosen the OPP detachment will be reduced by at least 11 positions. Whether some or any of these OPP officers choose to join the Kenora Police Service would be difficult to determine. The Kenora Police responses indicate there is some interests from police officers in other jurisdictions to join the local force.

3. Direct Operating Expenses:

The Kenora Police Service and the OPP have submitted their expected Direct Operating expenses for their respective policing models. Direct Operating Expenses refer to those annual expenses that will be required to support the policing operations.

The Kenora Police Service submitted a Direct Operating Expense projection of \$570,400²⁸. That calculation was determined by estimating their future costs based on present cost statements. The expenses appear to be conservatively stated and generally in line with their projected staff increase.

There is a statement in the Kenora Police Service expenses referring to a cost recovery of \$9600 which appears to be the costs recovered in the Communications area for providing dispatch services to the Emergency Sewer and Water Service (\$4800), to the KMTS Phone Company for weekend callouts (\$2400) and to Kenora Hydro Services for dispatch services (\$2400). These costs were removed as they do not create additional revenue for the City of Kenora. With this removal, the 2008 projected Direct Operating Expenses (DOE's) for the Kenora Police Service becomes **\$580,000**.²⁹ These costs are detailed in Table 3 of this report.

The Ontario Provincial Police use a different method of calculating their Direct Operating Expenses. Their method uses Provincial and Regionalized averaging of costs and attaches these costs on a per uniformed member or per civilian member rate.

²⁸ See Kenora Police Service response to RFP-Table 4: Direct Operating Expenses on Page 89.

²⁹ See Page 43- Table 3: Direct Operating Expenses for Kenora Police Service

In the Kenora proposal the OPP have determined their operating costs to be **\$621,525.**³⁰

As previously stated, the OPP Direct Operating Expense statement includes the fees charged for the OPP Operational Supports and Regional Headquarters Municipal Supports. The Ontario Shared Services fees is the OPP costs for managing various administrative functions such as payroll, benefits administration and legal services. At year end, the OPP Direct Operating expenses are reconciled to the community in the final year end reconciliation.

In the OPP model the administrative functions currently completed by the City of Kenora related to payroll and benefit administration, financial services, purchasing, legal representation, contract negotiation, purchasing, tendering, and accounting will be transferred to the Shared Services Bureau of the Ministry/OPP. While eliminating these services will result in less costs to the City there has been no attempt to equate a value to the reduced workload of the municipality.

The OPP Direct Operating costs are detailed in Table 4.

There is a significant variance between the OPP vehicle usage fees (\$313,242) and the vehicle usage fees of the Kenora Police Service (\$130,000). According to the City of Kenora Finance Manager the 2006 actual vehicle expenditures were \$121,271 and the 2008 budgeted vehicle forecast is \$121,942. It would be reasonable to expect the final year-end 2007 vehicle usage costs to be in the range of \$120,000. That rate will make the Kenora Police statement of the proposed vehicle usage for the expanded fleet of police vehicles slightly undervalued.

The Finance Manager also advises the Kenora Police Service vehicle statements do not include any capital costs component. The City of Kenora currently allocates \$80,000 per year for police vehicles in the City budget. This allocation contemplates a replacement cycle of two KPS police vehicles annually. As well, costs associated for operating the municipal garage and for the costs of the mechanics salary who service the KPS fleet are also not reflected in the vehicle usage statements of the Kenora Police Service.

All capital and maintenance costs, vehicle replacement costs, and insurance costs are included in the OPP vehicle usage rates charged in the contract.³¹ Assuming the additional vehicle costs for the OPP would be similar to the Kenora Police Service at \$191,976³² the two vehicle statements are consistent (OPP: \$313,242 and Kenora Police Service: \$321,976³³.) Placing the

³⁰ See Page 44-Table 4: Ontario Provincial Police-Total of Direct Operating Expenses and Ontario Shared Services fees.

³¹ Confirmed by OPP Municipal Policing Section Manager-Staff Sergeant Rod Case on 11Jan07.

³² See Page 92-Kenora Police Service Response to the Request for Proposal

³³ The figure \$321,976 is the costs of the new vehicles (\$191,976) and the \$130,000 expense.

additional capital outlay for replacement vehicles of \$80,000 into the equation, the KPS vehicle usage costs will exceed the OPP costs.

Without making the above adjustments the difference in the stated Direct Operating Expenses charged between the City of Kenora Police Service at \$580,000 and the OPP Direct Operating Expenses at \$621,525 leaves the Kenora statement \$41,525 less expensive.³⁴

4. Police Generated Revenues

The Kenora Police Service submitted a series of revenues/recoveries indicating the following off-sets that would be recovered from the policing operations in the City of Kenora.

These revenues consist of the following:

Service Fees:	\$30,000
Police Court Fines	\$50,000
Miscellaneous:	\$54,500
Solicitor General	\$228,500
911 Allocated Payroll	\$117,646
TOTAL:	\$480,546 ³⁵

In examining these fees I am satisfied that the Service Fees, Police Court Fines, Miscellaneous (Record Screening Revenues), and Solicitor-General Grants and other subsidies will be equally available to both police services. The legitimacy of creating records screening revenues is a concern in other policing studies and it is anticipated a decision on the continuation of these practices by police agencies will be made in the future. The OPP will have to determine if they will conduct third party record screening checks such as the Kenora Police Service is completing for the Insurance Bureau of Canada. If not, the loss of revenue to the community will be the \$54,500.

The Steering Committee Chair in his opening comments at the December 18, 2007 Public Meeting indicated that all future police recovered fees would be revenues secured by the municipality and would not be used as police cost off-sets so the impact of these revenues is negated as a reduction to policing budgets. In an OPP contract policing agreement the OPP do not and cannot retain any fees collected while providing contracted services to a municipality.

³⁴ See Tables 3 and 4 at pages 43 and 44.

³⁵ See Kenora Police Services response to the RFP, Section 26, Page 90.

The Kenora Police Service statement also listed a revenue offset of \$117,646 for the 911 Allocated Payroll. This item is not a recovery or revenue generation for the City of Kenora. This is a ledger entry dealing with the transfer of municipal funds to the police service and reflects a prior agreement on municipal cost sharing for operating the 911 call handling services. The amount of \$117,646 is not a revenue.

Council is exploring options for 911 call handling including the option of the OPP operating this function at 56 cents per population. Their fees would be approximately \$8500 per year to operate the 911 system.

These cost recoveries are revenue neutral to the evaluation since they are equally applicable to both police services.

5. OPP Generated Recoveries and Adjustments:

The OPP cost statement for salary and benefits includes an OPP Retention Bonuses factor in their staffing costs. Police industry standards in Ontario have now resulted in retention bonuses being the accepted practice in police contract settlements. Arbitration settlements have also granted this bonus system to police officers.

The retention bonus allows for usually a 3%, 6% and 9% salary bonuses for various service levels. It was first offered to the Metropolitan Toronto Police Service to deter the loss by that service of trained officers to other Ontario police services. The Kenora Police staff and benefits statement do not include this bonus fee since their last contract in 2005 did not contain the bonus system. It is understood from the discussions with the Police Service Board that the Kenora Police Association have made the bonus system an in-going demand in the current negotiations.

The OPP costs *were not* adjusted downward to reflect parallel costs as the Kenora Police Service without the bonus system.

The OPP, in an initial contract negotiation, must use the OPP provincial overtime average rate which is currently 9%. The Ontario Provincial Police in subsequent contracts will quote overtime based on the three year average overtime usage of the Kenora Detachment. In the Kenora Detachment, the three year averaged overtime use was 7.18%. If this three year average was applied to the OPP salary and benefit calculations their costs would have been reduced by a further 1.82% of the salary cost amounts, creating a reduction of \$62,898.³⁶

³⁶ The \$62,898 is determined by applying the 1.82% overtime factor to the \$3,455,913 Total Uniform Salary of the OPP Costing Summary.

In conducting their salary and benefit calculations the RFP specified the two police services would use a three year averaged overtime factor in estimating their overtime usages. The above averaging has now been applied to the OPP salary statements. The Kenora Police Service three year overtime average use was stated as being \$250,000 per year. This figure translates into a three year average overtime percentage of 6.47% when applied to the 2008 projected uniform salary rate of \$3,859,884.³⁷

The Ontario Provincial Police provide a financial return to communities known as a Provincial Services Usage (PSU) rebate reflecting the frequency of the deployment of OPP officers, both municipally funded and provincially funded OPP offices, to meet provincial responses for emergencies, disasters or to perform specialized investigative needs.

In the Kenora Detachment, the averaging of the past three years Provincial Services Usage rebates indicated an annual return of 8.87%. That PSU factor is applied to the total OPP contract cost. Using this same average of 8.87% in estimating the PSU rebate that would be applied to the OPP proposal (the OPP total cost statement of \$5,835,197 less the overtime reduction of \$62,898) would result in a revenue offset of a further \$512,003. This makes the actual OPP cost, with both reductions, to be \$5,260,296.

It is legitimate to include a Provincial Services Utilization rebate in the OPP police cost quote.

In calculating their salary and benefit statements in the Request for Proposal, specifically to capture the mid-point in a police officers career and mid-point in OPP retention bonus payments, both police services were directed to submit their salary and benefit statements based on all members in all ranks having a seniority level of 17 years service.

6. Summary of Cost Statements and Direct Operating Expenses:

The Ontario Provincial Police model, including the staffing adjustment of two additional officers, their quoted Direct Operating Costs and reductions for averaged three year overtime and Provincial Services Rebate, results in a cost for OPP policing of \$5,260,296. This amount is \$1,729,633 less expensive than the Kenora Police costs of \$6,989,929.

The OPP policing proposal contains 82 available OPP officers at the Kenora Detachment and the Kenora Police proposal contains 51 municipal officers. Table 2 has provided a comparative of the two models and the Ontario Provincial Police model, augmented by other available detachment and regional supports (included in their costs), is considered at the very least equal to the Kenora Police Service proposal for the City of Kenora.

³⁷ Kenora Police Services response to the Request for Proposal-Page 85.

The calculations in the following Chart do not include the one-time start up costs that both police services identified will be required for their policing models to become operational. The Committee should view this Chart as the expected annual costs for the two police services to operate their respective policing models.

The OPP calculations were rationalized by removing the Provincial Services Utilization of 5% that was included in the OPP cost statements. That was to allow a fair and consistent actual cost comparison of gross policing costs. The Provincial Services Utilizations refund that is reflected in the following chart re-applies the PSU rebate using the three year average rebate. This process was similar to the three year averaging of overtime.

This approach is fair and more reflective of the OPP refund activity that the City of Kenora should reasonably expect if choosing the OPP police service model.

Comparison of Salary, Benefit and Direct Operating Expenses

	<u>OPP Cost Statements</u>	<u>KPS Cost Statements</u>
Salary and Benefits	\$5,213,672	\$6,409,929
Direct Operating Expenses	\$621,525	\$580,000
OPP Adjustment for Overtime to Kenora Detachment Three Year Average (7.18%) from 9% as quoted.	-\$62,898	Included in Cost Statement
OPP Adjustment for OPP Provincial Services Rebate based on the Kenora Detachment Three Year Average (8.87%)	-\$512,003	Not Applicable
TOTAL	\$5,260,296	\$6,989,929
Annual Cost Difference for OPP Proposal vs. Kenora Police Proposal.	\$1,729,633	

7. One-Time Start Up Costs:

Kenora Police Services:

The study accepts the Kenora Police Services one-time start up costs of \$328,015. At the December 18, 2007 presentations Chief Jorgensen indicated these costs consist of:

Equipping two new police offices:	\$40,548
Equipment for 16 additional officers:	\$95,491
Purchase two new marked vehicles and one police 4 X4 Truck	\$191,976
Totaling:	\$328,015 (\$320,015 on his slide)

A more detailed summary of the Kenora Police Services one time start up costs are contained in their response to the Request for Proposal. Those figures total \$328,015 and not \$320,015 as stated.³⁸ This calculation does not include costs associated with the Civilian Data Entry equipment or the upgrades necessary for the Kenora Police communications system.

In a city-wide policing responsibility the City of Kenora Police Service will be required to provide reliable two-way portable communications throughout the whole of the City of Kenora for police mobile and foot patrols. This is an Adequacy Standards requirement.³⁹ The current police radio system would not meet this standard if the Kenora Police Service was to police the total City.

While it is not an adequacy requirement the Kenora Police communications system does not provide their officers with an "officer needs assistance" feature on their police radios because the current analogue radio consoles are not capable of receiving these signals.⁴⁰ The RFP required the police services to develop this feature in their proposals.

The Kenora Police Service filed a Projected VHF Radio Coverage Study that was completed by CRC Communications in Thunder Bay⁴¹. This mapping diagram shows large areas of the City of Kenora without proper portable radio coverage.

³⁸ See Page 92 of the Response to the Request for Proposal-Kenora Police Service

³⁹ Ontario Regulation 3/99 Adequacy and Effectiveness of Police Services, Section 6 (b).

⁴⁰ See Section 5 (3) of the Response to the Request for Proposal-Kenora Police Service.

⁴¹ See Tab 13 of the Supplementary Information submitted by the Kenora Police Service.

CRC Communications provided two quotes for establishing a more appropriate radio system. The first quote maintains the existing analogue system whose oldest component is the 12 year old police console. CRC filed two upgrade options. One for the continued use of the existing system at a cost of \$104,634 and if chosen a digital/hybrid upgrade to the existing system at a total installation cost of \$114,335. This upgrade would allow for future digital upgrades to the Kenora Police Service communications equipment.

CRC Communications also submitted a second Option to provide a fully digital police communications system including digital mapping capability and a new console at a cost of \$452,506. A second back-up console would also be required to provide a redundancy or fall back capability in the event of the main console failure. This cost was not included in the Option 2 quote. The back-up console for the current police system is at the KMTS building in Kenora.

Similar upgrades were quoted by the Spectrum Group in Keewatin which shows their Option One costs at \$86,886 and the Option Two costs for a digitalized system at \$422,256.

To determine whether the proposed communications options would be effective and actually result in full mobile and portable communications will require an expensive and detailed communications engineering study but for the purpose of this study I have accepted the CRC Option 1 quote with the hybrid analogue/digital upgrade at a cost of **\$114,335** to be the most reasonable upgraded system cost. The reason why the lower priced Spectrum Group quote was not considered was because their quote did not include any tower upgrades to the Kenora Police tower on the Norman site.

With the Kenora Police communications system upgrade at a cost of \$114,335 the total expected one time start up costs for the Kenora Police Service will be at least **\$442,350**.⁴²

Ontario Provincial Police:

The Ontario Provincial Police have estimated their one time start-up costs at \$358,620. Details of these start up costs are contained within the OPP costing proposal at Tab 3.

The OPP Communications costs are included in the contract price and the existing Legacy radio system in use by the OPP in Kenora will be replaced with a new state of the art Bell FleetNet OPP Provincial Communications Centre in Thunder Bay. The Thunder Bay installation is the last of five such OPP Integrated Communications Centres in the Province. Both the current Legacy system and the FleetNet system are reported by the OPP to provide 100% mobile and portable police radio coverage throughout the City of Kenora.⁴³ All OPP radio equipment includes the "officer needs assistance" capability.

⁴² This total includes the Kenora Police Service one time start up costs of \$320,015 and the additional \$114,335 communications upgrade Option 1-Hybrid.

⁴³ See OPP Response to the Request for Proposal, Section 5 (2) and (3).

The OPP Communications Centres also provide call-taking and dispatch services to the Treaty Three Police Service and Aboriginal Police Service members. The Treaty Three and Aboriginal Police Service's communications equipment is supplied through the OPP Telecommunications services. This allows all three police services to hear all calls for service for policing in the District of Kenora, including in the City of Kenora.

In stating their start up costs the OPP takes the position that no Kenora Police Service equipment, including vehicles and handguns, are useable by the OPP (worst case scenario). This obviously is not the case and any equipment the OPP can purchase from the City of Kenora Police Service will be bought at fair market pricing. Purchasing of this equipment will off-set the OPP start up costs charged to the City but until a policing decision is made it would have been inappropriate for the OPP to have conducted an equipment assessment at the Kenora Police Service. Equipment not purchased by the OPP will be returned to the City for their disposal and sell.

The OPP start up costs include all computer network cable installations that will be necessary for the OPP equipment to be used in the Kenora Police Services building. If the Water Street facility is used as an Extended Service Office then there will be an additional computer line drop fee of \$5500. As well, if Council requests the use of the Water Street OPP location as a downtown Community Police Office the City will be responsible for any renovations costs to accommodate this use. According to the OPP Contract Policing manager there is a strong likelihood that the OPP would not charge further fees for the use of the Water Street facility since the building is already in use for other OPP purposes. If a future decision entails larger use of this building as a full service office then rental use fees will need to be negotiated.

The OPP have also included in their one time start-up costs the providing of a beat radio system at a cost of \$28,000. Depending on the feasibility and need for such a radio system this cost may be eliminated since the OPP officers already have officer to officer communications through both their portable communications and tactical communications capability. The elimination of the beat radio system would bring the OPP start up costs down to \$310,653.

The difference in one time start up costs between the OPP costs at \$358,620 and the Kenora Police Service proposal at \$442,350 is \$83,730 less expensive for the OPP model.

8. Financial Summary of Proposals:

The initial OPP response to the Request for Proposal was based on a staffing level of 40.5 OPP members. While the OPP was content with that number the Consultant recommended the Committee require two additional positions be put into the OPP model to compensate for the lack of information that should have been supplied by the Kenora Police Services Board and the Kenora Police Service and to address the community expressed policing requirements.

This increase brought the OPP integrated staffing proposal to 42.5 uniform members.

The Kenora Police Service developed a predominantly stand alone municipal police model that contains 51 uniformed positions including five new constable functions for Training Officer, Community Services Officer, Crime Analyst/Policy Review, Guns and Gangs enforcement, and a Youth Officer.

This report has demonstrated that both the Kenora Police Service and the Ontario Provincial Police staffing models are at least equal given the additional supports provided in an OPP integrated detachment approach.

Cost differences of the two proposals show the OPP model to be **\$1,729,623** less expensive annually to operate than the Kenora Police proposal. Given the equal adequacy of both models, this cost difference is significant.

The expected one time start up costs by the OPP are at least **\$83,730⁴⁴** less than the start up costs for the Kenora Police Service. The Kenora Police Services annual projected Direct Operating Expenses are estimated at **\$41,525** less expensive than the OPP estimate but inclusions of the vehicle capital purchasing costs of \$80,000 per year make the OPP Direct Operating Expenses less expensive.

The OPP annual costs for policing in 2008 values are calculated at **\$5,260,296**. This cost is less than the 2007 estimated costs of \$6,040,819 (not including summer students, Police Commission, and OPP Fines) to operate the current hybrid policing model. *The continuation of the hybrid policing model should no longer be a consideration for policing in the City of Kenora*

Both police service models are expected to bring in the same revenues and grants to the City of Kenora. These revenues are expected to amount to \$363,000.

On the basis of costs and the number of patrol officers that will be available to police the City of Kenora the Ontario Provincial Police policing model is superior to the Kenora Police Service model. The Ontario Provincial Police model also relieves the City of Kenora from the cost of defending and the legal liability for lawsuits stemming from the operation of the police service.

The City will realize indirect cost savings through the transfer of various administrative, financial, purchasing, contract negotiation, and payroll functions currently staffed by City employees.

The City of Kenora will continue to be responsible under Section 4 of the Police Services Act to supply the necessary infrastructure for police operations but these costs will be reduced through the use of existing OPP buildings.

⁴⁴ Kenora Police Start Up costs are \$442,350 and OPP Start up costs are \$358,620.

The City of Kenora will be expected to maintain and allow OPP use of the Kenora Police Services Building until future decisions can be made in regards to expanding cell facilities in the OPP buildings on either Water Street or the main detachment building. During this period the City of Kenora will not be faced with any accommodations costs for the officers operating from municipally owned facilities.

The City will need to continue funding the operations of the Police Service Board and the cost of providing the Community Policing Office in Keewatin.

9. **Recommendation**

The Ontario Provincial Police, operating an integrated detachment model, is the recommended police service provider for city-wide policing in the City of Kenora.

This recommendation is based on the following:

1. The OPP model provides eight Sergeant and Constable patrol officers in the City of Kenora model. The Kenora Police Service staffing model is six patrol Constables. The KPS Sergeant is assigned to the Kenora Police Building.
2. The OPP model provides the strongest support framework and greatest availability of both regular and specialist police functions through the OPP's integrated services approach. The OPP's detachment, regional and provincial policing capabilities will meet all requirements for policing in Kenora.
3. The OPP will offer employment to the same Kenora Police Service officers that now police the Kenora community including full recognition for the pension credits, other service time qualifiers and opportunity for promotion.

Ranking members will have their rank in the OPP determined through the approved rank determination process of the Ministry. If this qualification results in more ranking police officers than the police model requires, the cost of carrying the extra ranking officers in an over-fill capacity will be that of the OPP.

4. The OPP salary and benefit packages, over all, are superior to those currently negotiated by the Kenora Police Association. This benefit package includes

retention bonuses and guarantees of equal career opportunity for the Kenora Police Services members.

5. The OPP have committed to not relocating the former Kenora Police Officers from the community for a minimum of three years. It is the practice of the OPP to not transfer amalgamated police services officers after this three year period unless the officer requests a transfer, specializes or promotes. In rare cases, operational or other requirements may require the relocation of a member after the initial three year period.
6. While the OPP have not had the benefit of all of the information they requested in submitting their proposal they have committed to continuing all of the existing community programs and to provide additional community based programming as required.

The OPP are the municipal police service in 313 Ontario communities with 106 of the communities policed under a Section 10 Police Services Act contract Agreement. This makes the OPP the largest supplier of municipal police services in Ontario. They have a substantial reputation in Ontario for providing effective community based policing programs. That community based policing philosophy is contained in the OPP Mission, Vision and Value statements which were filed with the study. The Kenora OPP also provided existing Annual Business Plans containing measurable statements of performance.

The Kenora Police Service did not maintain a Business Plan between 2004 to 2007 and have just recently released their Business plan for 2008 to 2010 and their Annual Plan for 2005 and 2006. (October and November 2007)

7. The OPP have a full-time Sergeant member assigned to the Treaty Three Police Service to assist that service in developing joint OPP and Treaty Three community policing programs and to provide OPP liaison to that aboriginal police service. This position is deployed to the Treaty Three operations from the Integrated Support Services Unit of the OPP First Nations Policing Section.

There is a local history of strong relations between the Treaty Three Police Service and the OPP. A policing protocol exists between these two services and that protocol was provided to the study. Until the opening of the new Treaty Three Police Headquarters, the OPP housed 48 Treaty Three Police Service members at the Kenora Detachment.

All Aboriginal Police Officers and the OPP officers are equipped, dispatched and operate through the same OPP Communications Centres.

8. The OPP Regional and Detachment resource base includes officers whose full and part-time duty is to build and maintain relationships within all Aboriginal communities. (Aboriginal Relationship Team-ART)
9. The OPP provides the community with a complete single police service response for all levels of police investigation in the community and they are not reliant on other police service providers for any of their policing requirements.
10. The OPP holds the highest level of confidence as an investigative service as expressed by the Judiciary, Crown Attorney and the medical community (Chief of Staff).
11. According to the RFP responses there are more OPP officers (21) that have been stationed in Kenora more than 10 years as compared to the Kenora Police Service. (13)
12. The OPP have demonstrated active crime analysis systems and sophisticated performance monitoring systems that are inter-connected across all levels of the OPP from the detachment to the OPP Commissioner.
13. The OPP contract includes a statement committing the OPP to meet or exceed all Provincial Adequacy Standards and other legislative requirements.
14. The OPP provides a localized policing response of as many as 106 OPP officers for an emergency in the City of Kenora. The detachment itself will contain 82 OPP members.

The detachment also has the full-time availability of a Mobile Command Unit, Bomb Disposal Unit Robot, and members of a well equipped Emergency Response Team. The OPP North-West Region also contains a Provincial Emergency Response Team and a Public Order Unit that will be available for the emergency servicing of the City of Kenora.
15. The OPP Forensic capability in the City of Kenora is one of the strongest and most well equipped Forensic facilities in Ontario meeting all legal requirements for exhibit processing and handling.
16. All OPP officers in the City of Kenora have Special Constable designations with the RCMP that provides authority to conduct cross-jurisdictional investigations by both police services in Ontario and in Manitoba.
17. The OPP proposal avoids costs to the City of Kenora for Communications upgrades and various administrative and financial support functions currently required with municipal policing.

18. The OPP have operated under their proposed budget for the five years studied during the review while meeting or exceeding their contractual service hour commitments to the City of Kenora. ⁴⁵
19. The OPP have an existing Auxiliary Police Unit of 20 Auxiliary Constables.
20. The OPP proposal provides a *contractually based policing cost* that is expected to annually be at least **\$1,729,633** less costly than the Kenora Police Services submission while providing a comparable level of police service.

This review reflects both the submissions of the two police services and a large amount of information that was examined throughout the study. A detailed comparison of the Kenora Police Service and Ontario Provincial Police submissions has been completed. Recent responses by both police services to a series of questions posed by Councillor Rory Mc McMillan have also been received and reviewed.

This study was supported by several members of the City of Kenora and their contribution and work in completing this report is graciously acknowledged.

John E. Watkins

Project Consultant

Consultant on Police Services Inc.

Table 1: Comparative Police Resources Population and Rates per capita based on 2006 Stats Canada Report on

⁴⁵ See OPP response to the Request for Proposal-Section 27 (8).

Policing in Canada

Note: Statistics Canada in some cases rounds up part position figures.
 For instance the OPP Kenora model contains 11.12 positions that are rounded up to 12 positions. Some variances from actual figures can occur in the actual versus Statistics Canada position counts.

<u>Municipality</u>	<u>Population</u>	<u>Number of Police Officers</u>	<u>Number of Civilians</u>	<u>Police Officers per capita</u>
<i>Kenora Police Service</i>	<i>9603</i>	<i>36</i>	<i>24</i>	<i>267</i>
<i>Kenora OPP</i>	<i>7139</i>	<i>12</i>	<i>1</i>	<i>595</i>
<i>Kenora Combined Service</i>	<i>16,742</i>	<i>48</i>	<i>25</i>	<i>348</i>
 <u>Municipal Police Services</u>				
Thunder Bay	116,137	222	98	523
Midland PS	16,047	26	10	617
Pembroke	13,530	29	23	467
<i>Port Hope PS-Ward 1</i>	<i>12,328</i>	<i>25</i>	<i>21</i>	<i>493</i>
<i>Port Hope-Ward 2 OPP</i>	<i>4,109</i>	<i>4</i>	<i>0</i>	<i>1027</i>
<i>Port Hope Combined Service</i>	<i>16,437</i>	<i>29</i>	<i>21</i>	<i>567</i>
Timiskiming Shores	10,802	10	8	1080
West Nipissing	13,441	20	5	672
Timmins	42,760	82	34	521
Dryden	8,190	20	12	410
 <u>OPP Police Services</u>				
Greater Napanee OPP	16274	22	3	740
Loyalist-Kingston area	15,547	18	2	864
South Frontenac-Kingston	17,851	16	1	1116
Tillsonburg	15,734	22	3	715
Kemptville	15,451	19	2	813
Elliott Lake	16,471	19	1	604
Ingersoll Town	12,059	19	2	635
Mississippi Mills	12,678	9	0	1409
North Perth	12,620	17	0	742
Petawawa	14,156	13	1	1089
Smith-Ennismore	14,682	14	1	1049

Trent Hills	13,268	19	3	698
Fort Francis	8,144	20	1	407
Blue Mountain OPP	6,899	17	1	406
Town of Collingwood	16,462	29	11	568

Manitoban Communities

Winnipeg	648,929	1275	344	509
Brandon PS	42792	77	26	556
Portage La Prairie-RCMP	12950	26	0	498
SteinbachRCMP	11039	12	2	902
Thompson-RCMP	13299	44	0	302

Table 2A - Kenora Police Salaries and Benefits-Sworn Members

<u>Position:</u>	<u>As Stated</u>	<u>2008 Equivalent at 3%</u>	<u>Difference 2007-08</u>
Chief	\$93,668	\$96,478.40	
Deputy	\$85,959	\$88,537.77	
Patrol Sergeants	\$311,811	\$321,165	
Detective Sergeant	\$77,953	\$80,291.59	
Patrol Constables	\$1,733,490	\$1,785,494.70	
Detective Constables	\$361,144	\$371,978.32	
Policy Analyst	\$72,229	\$74,395.87	
Community Services/Media	\$72,229	\$74,395.87	
Training Officer	\$72,229	\$74,395.87	
Traffic Constables	\$144,458	\$148,791.74	
Foot/Bicycle Patrol	\$144,458	\$148,791.74	
Marine/Snow vehicle/ATV	\$144,458	\$148,791.74	
Forensic Identification	\$72,229.00	\$74,395.87	
Guns and Gangs	\$72,229	\$74,395.87	
Youth Constable	\$72,229	\$74,395.87	
Intelligence Constable	\$72,229	\$74,396	
Drug Constable	\$72,229	\$74,396	
Court Constable	\$72,229	\$74,396	
Totals-Salary Only for Uniformed Positions	\$3,747,460	\$3,859,883.83	\$112,423.80
	(Changed from KPS Number)		
<u>Benefits:</u>			
Overtime at 3 year average (10.2%)	\$382,348	\$393,818.44	
Vacation Pay	\$79,283	\$81,661.49	
Shift Premium	\$17,150	\$17,664.50	
Benefits (26.4%)	\$991,154	\$1,020,888.60	
Total-Benefits Only for Uniform Positions	\$1,469,935.00	\$1,514,033.03	
UNIFORM SALARY AND BENEFITS-KPS MODEL	\$5,217,395	\$5,373,916	\$156,521.80

Table 2B Kenora Police-Salaries and Benefits-Civilian Members

<u>Position</u>	<u>As Stated</u>	<u>2008 Projected</u>	<u>Difference 2007-08</u>
Executive Secretary	\$51,979	\$53,538	
Clerk Receptionist	\$51,533	\$53,079	
Building Maintenance	\$25,000	\$25,750	
Communications Supervisor	\$51,079	\$52,611	
Data Entry Clerks	\$98,039	\$100,980	
Full-time ECO	\$196,077	\$201,959	
Part-Time ECO	\$78,362	\$80,713	
Prisoner Guards	\$163,376	\$168,277	
Special Constables	\$77,437	\$79,760	
Total Civilian Salaries	\$792,882	\$816,667	\$23785
<u>Civilian Benefits:</u>			
Overtime (3.78%)	\$30,000	\$30,900	
Vacation Pay	\$17,443	\$17,966	
Shift Premium	\$6,650	\$6,849	
Benefits (20%)	\$158,865	\$163,631	
Total Benefits	\$212,958.00	\$219,346	
Total Civilian Salary and Benefits	\$1,005,840	\$1,036,013	\$30,173

Table 3: KENORA POLICE SERVICES DIRECT OPERATING EXPENSES

	2007	2008
	<u>Budgeted Costs</u>	<u>Projected City-wide</u>
Advertising	\$4,000	\$8,000
Computer and CPIC	\$60,400	\$76,000
Consulting Fees	\$30,000	\$2,000
Insurance	\$1,185	\$2,000
Materials and Supplies	\$21,000	\$25,000
Miscellaneous Expenditures	\$19,835	\$25,000
Office and Postage	\$19,000	\$25,000
Prisoner Escort and Meals	\$1,600	\$2,000
Rental of Equipment	\$8,400	\$12,600
Rental of own equipment	\$1,200	\$2,400
Repairs/Maintenance Cleaning	\$50,000	\$50,000
Subscriptions and Memberships	\$3,750	\$3,000
Telephone and Utilities	\$55,000	\$65,000
Training	\$65,000	\$80,000
Travel and Conferences	\$10,000	\$15,000
Forensic Identification	\$10,650	\$11,000
Containment Team	\$17,000	\$17,000
In-service Training	\$8,600	\$15,000
Citizens on Patrol/Volunteers	\$800	\$2,000
Rental of 136 Main St. S Office	\$0	\$12,000
Vehicles	\$92,037	\$130,000
TOTAL	\$479,457	\$580,000

Table 4: Ontario Provincial Police-Direct Operating Expenses

	\$27,621.00
Operational Support	
RHQ Municipal Support	\$59,286.00
Vehicle Usage	\$313,242.00
Telephone	\$42,432.00
Office Supplies	\$11,789.00
Accommodation	\$5,958.00
Uniform & Equipment Note 1	\$9,244.16
Uniform & Equipment (Special Constables)	Note 1
Furniture & Equipment	Note 2
Cleaning Contract	\$33,239.00
Mobile Radio Equipment Maintenance	\$24,302.00
Mobile Radio Equipment Maintenance (Special Constables) - (Note 3)	\$310.00
Office Automation - Uniform	\$81,077.00
Office Automation - Civilian	<u>\$5,958.00</u>
<i>Direct Operating Expenses</i>	\$614,459.00
<i>OSS Financial Services Fee</i>	<u>\$7,066.00</u>
Total	\$621,525.00

Note 1: Uniforms covered in One Time Costs
Subsequent years are calculated at
\$736 per member per annum.

Note 2: If OPP buildings are used equipment is
included. If Municipal provided
building are used the Furniture and Equipment
is the responsibility of the Municipality to
provide.

Note 3: Mobile Radio Equipment for Special
Constables (2 radios) will be calculated at
\$155 per year.
